Abstract

The paper systematically discusses the literature on terrorism and tourism between the years 2010 to 2019. The Scopus database was selected to make the literature search process transparent, and the literature survey was based on terrorism and tourism as the keywords. The PRISMA 2009 helped the selection and exclusion process. During literature classification, the final 37 articles with at least one citation for the review were arranged in an excel sheet to find the gap and directions of terrorism and tourism. The results revealed literature on the nature of the relationship between terrorism and tourism, critical challenges related to terrorism, regional effects of terrorism on tourism, and terrorism impact preventing strategies. The systematic review recommends that future research must focus on critical disputes related to terrorism, and suitable strategies to prevent terrorism.

Keywords: PRISMA framework, Scopus database, Systematic review Terrorism, Tourism

JEL Classification: Z32, H56

I. INTRODUCTION

The occurrence of terrorist incidents is steadily increasing worldwide in the past few years—hence, many determinates influence the choice of a tourist destination. Unlike other factors on tourist arrivals, terrorism has a negative impact. Personal safety has become the critical unavoidable prominent determinant of tourist arrivals. Terrorism and tourism are highly dependent situations of an economy, and the impact of terrorism on tourist destinations and industries can be enormous. Terrorism is defined as an act of violence or threatens, which kills an average of 21,000 people worldwide each year. The global terrorism deaths from 8000 in 2010 increased to 44,000 in 2014, while 95% of the world terrorism deaths in 2017 have occurred in the Middle East, Africa, and South Asia. Any terrorism incident, which is a danger to personal safety in a tourist destination, adversely impact on tourist arrivals. Many studies have focused on the effect of terrorism incidents on tourism globally, and past evidence from the literature proves declines in global visitor arrival due to security and safety risks in a country. Terrorism causes political instability of a country, which leads to the decline of tourist arrival (Seddighi et al., 2001; Lin et al., 2017). Many empirical studies have identified the adverse effect of terrorism on tourism (Bassil et al., 2019; Corbet et al. 2019; Gamage et al., 2017; Baker, 2014; Muckley, 2010).

Terrorism is a dangerous, constant, historically variable social phenomenon resulting in terrorist acts following from political situations and world happenings. Terrorism has been a political tool in the past decades. The most significant and shocking terrorist attacks in the last decades are Bloody Friday in Belfast, the Munich Olympic Massacre in 1972, and the hijacking at the Rome airport in 1973.

During the 90s, terrorist attacks took place all over the world. Terrorism is centralized mainly in the
Middle East and North Africa (MENA), South Asia, and African regions, which together account for 84 percent of attacks and 95 percent of deaths. The second-most terrorist attacks were in South Asia in Afghanistan, Pakistan, and India. Asia-Pacific accounted only for 7 percent of all attacks and 2 percent of deaths, where most attacks are related to local political goals (Global Terrorism Index, 2016).

The primary keywords used in this review are ‘terrorism’ and ‘tourism.’ There is a gap in the studies that reveal only the investigations related to specific keywords. The report also analyzed all studies with the keywords of terrorism and tourism. All research activities in this area discussed the impact of terrorism on tourism rather than reviewing the literature discussed in terrorism and tourism. Thus, this study fulfills the gap within the literature, which is a lack of systematic review articles on terrorism and tourism. Also, most studies have concentrated on the negative relationship between terrorism and tourism, while some scholars have identified many other diverse links. Nevertheless, the available literature is insufficient to form a specific conclusion. The present study pinpoints future directions for identifying diverse types of relationships between terrorism and tourism. Although most articles on terrorism and tourism have focused on the relationship between variables, the studies should emphasize the critical challenges of terrorism towards tourism. With the considerable amount of past findings available, a systematic literature review paper may be essential to identify previous literature, existing gaps, and future directions of the subject field.

The main objective of the current study is to analyze research papers on terrorism and tourism. The simple research question addressed in this study is, “what is discussed under terrorism and tourism?” The main objectives of the review are to identify the impact of terrorism on tourism, determine challenges arising due to terrorism, identify the environmental effects on tourism, and determine strategies to prevent terrorism. Thus, the review focuses on the area of terrorism and tourism from 2010 to 2019. The studies will overview the literature to discover how researchers contribute to the knowledge of terrorism and tourism. Also, it will consider significant areas of research and recommended future agendas.

As the first step of the study, a quality screening process will be conducted using the PRISMA statement. The data inclusion and exclusion process will be followed by a descriptive analysis and literature classification. Finally, after the review process, recommendations and conclusions will discuss to offer future agendas.
Figure 1: Flow diagram for study selection based on the PRISMA guidelines
III. RESULTS AND INTERPRETATION

3.1 Quality Assessment

The best possible articles were purified to have the most complete and significant articles for the study through the process of eligibility and inclusion criteria. Quality assessment of review papers was conducted to exclude articles from the study. The language selected for the articles was English as it has universal acceptability, and most literature is published in English. Hence, the review only selected the articles written in the English language; papers of other languages were removed. Research articles from the database were elected only from the subject of social science. The review considered only the open-access articles, and also, it removed articles published in 2020 and the ones without at least one citation. The final 37 studies (research conducted between 2009 to 2019) were employed for the final process to identify future directions and missing areas. Abstracts and conclusions of the articles were analyzed in-depth to analyze and purify the articles.

3.2 Descriptive Analysis of the Review

The records were analyzed based on the criteria of year, citation, published journals, publisher, and the country, to have a better and a purified analysis.

3.2.1 Year-wise Publications

Figure 2 presents the year-wise publications of final articles. The review used articles from 2009 to 2019, considering 2009 as the initial year and 2019 as the final year of articles selected for the study. The number of papers selected in 2019 is 05, and the highest number of articles (09) was published in 2017. The year 2018 is the second-highest article selection with eight articles, whereas the lowest number of articles were published in the years 2012 and 2015, one article per year.

3.2.2 Most Cited Papers

Research publications of terrorism and tourism are appreciated and mentioned by other researchers in their articles. The records with at least one citation by other researchers were used in this study. The most cited papers with more than 20 citations are included in Table 1. The most cited article on terrorism and tourism is “The Moderation Effects of Political Instability and Terrorism on Tourism Development: A Cross-Country Panel Analysis” by Saha and Yap (2014). This paper has been cited 112 times, until 2019.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Citation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Moderation Effects of Political Instability and Terrorism on Tourism Development: A Cross-Country Panel Analysis</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism’s vulnerability and resilience to terrorism</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism and tourism: A conjunction and ramification in Pakistan</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do political instability, terrorism, and corruption have deterring effects on tourism development even in the presence of UNESCO heritage? A cross-country panel estimate</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact of terrorism on tourism in Turkey: Empirical evidence from Turkey</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 3.2.3 Country-wise Publications

Research on terrorism and tourism have been conducted as an individual country, multiple countries or regions, and globally. Chart 2 specifies the country of the published articles. The highest numbers of articles were published on a global basis. The other countries which researched the specific area are recorded in Figure 3.

![Figure 3: Country-wise Publications](image)

### 3.2.4 Journal-based Publications

The other significant assessment made for the study is identifying the Journal area. Data figure 4 identifies that various journals have published papers, and most articles are published in three journals, i.e., *Tourism Economics, Tourism Analysis*, and *Current Issues in Tourism*, which has published four papers by each journal. Figure 4 also presents other contributions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spatial spillovers from terrorism on tourism: Western victims in Islamic destination countries</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does International Tourism Affect Transnational Terrorism?</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect of terrorism on demand for tourism in Kenya</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maritime tourism and terrorism: Customer perceptions of the potential terrorist threat to cruise shipping</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2.5 Publisher-based publications

Table 2 reports the publishers of the articles. Accordingly, most articles belong to Routledge Publishers, who have published six papers out of the 37 articles on terrorism and tourism. Thirty-one papers have mentioned their publishers, but others have not mentioned their publishers precisely, as shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Publisher-based publication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Published Article</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Routledge</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elsevier Ltd</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAGE Publications Inc.</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognizant Communication Corporation</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dublin Institute of Technology</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emerald Group Publishing Ltd.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAGE Publications Ltd</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambridge University Press</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre of Sociological Research</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Laboratory for Transition Research</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Association of Geographers</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDPI AG</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Mentioned</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IV. CLASSIFICATION OF LITERATURE

The literature has been classified following specific findings of various scholars in each research specified in the descriptive analysis. The literature classification commenced after identifying the main findings with relationships, methodology, data analysis method, the country, and sample in the abstract. In the first step, the literature was classified based on the methodology of the study, as shown in figure 5.

![Figure 5: Distribution of papers based on the methodology](image)

The literature can be classified primarily under four criteria: 1) The nature of the relationship between terrorism and tourism, 2) Critical challenges related to terrorism, 3) Regional effects of terrorism on tourism, and 4) Terrorism impacts preventing strategies.

4.1 Nature of the relationship between terrorism and tourism

Data processing from the Scopus database on terrorism and tourism discussed the relationship between variables (Chart 5). Literature from the year 2010 to 2019 explores dynamic relationships of negative, diverse, nonlinear, U-shaped, and unidirectional in 37 studies. Among them, 29 studies focused on the relationship between terrorism and tourism, while others have not identified specific relationships. Most evidence from the empirical findings identifies a negative correlation between Terrorism and Tourism, which revealed that the impact of terrorism had caused tremendous damage to the tourism industry (Asongu, 2019; Bassil, 2019; Lanouar and Goaied, 2019; Gergaud et al. 2018; Chowdhury et al. 2017).

The empirical findings in Turkey reveal unidirectional nonlinear relationships between terrorism and tourism in both the long- and short-run (Karamelikli et al. 2019). The literature emphasizes that terrorism has no significant effect on FDI inflow in tourism since international tourism affects the FDI (Radić, 2018). It also investigates the asymmetric relationship between terrorism and tourism in Thailand (Fareed, 2018). The scholar Goldman and Neubauer (2017) invented an inverse U-shaped relationship between tourist attacks and tourist arrivals. The study also concluded that international tourism has a positive effect on transactional terrorism, which revealed that more tourist arrivals to a country, more terror attacks by foreigners, and at a significant point, the relationship becomes negative with inverse U shape (Goldman and Neubauer, 2017). The findings revealed that terrorist attacks increase the tourism demand for low-to-moderate political risk countries, but high-level political risk countries show a reduction in tourism demand. The evidence also reveals that political instability is more severe than the one-off terrorist attacks (Buigut et al. 2017; Saha and Yap 2014). The diverse types of relationships discussed in empirical studies are as follows (Figure 6).

![Figure 6: Distribution of papers by the relationship between Terrorism and Tourism](image)

4.2 Critical challenges related to terrorism

Literature from the year 2010 to 2019 also explores critical challenges related to terrorism. Terrorism is most challenging for tourist arrivals in different countries. The most critical risk is the reduction of tourism demand for a state, which eventually reduces the country’s income. It also causes different challenges to different areas rather than tourism demand. The effect of military expenditures for armed services is higher when terrorism increases in a country (Asongu et al. 2019).

Terrorism in one country affects other countries (Bassil, 2019). The key microeconomic variables have an adverse impact on terrorism rather than tourism (Ajogbeje et al. 2017). The dark tourism activities developed around the sites in terrorist attacks in France, which challenged the leadership of the destination (Seraphin, 2017). A potential decrease in air travel is also noted as a result of terrorist attacks. Due to terrorism, environmental mismanagement and global warming have negatively impacted the tourism industry in the world (Rashid and Robinson, 2010). However, as explained before, very few scholars have paid attention to discussing such critical challenges related to terrorism.

4.3 Regional effects of terrorism on tourism

The literature shows the environmental impacts of terrorism and tourism. The effect has been discussed in a single country, multiple countries, and mostly for the world. The country or regional situations influence the studies. Countries such as Turkey, Israel, Lebanon, France, Egypt, Lithuania, and Nigeria have conducted most studies. This region is one of the most unstable areas in the world, with terrorist incidents. Studies on terrorism and tourism from regions/countries with the highest terrorism incidents show a significantly negative impact.
Figure 7 evaluates the regions of published articles. Most papers are based on a global context, while the highest numbers of articles are in the European region and the second-highest in Middle-East countries. There is a gap in the studies in other areas compared to the European and Middle East regions.

![Figure 7: Distribution of Papers based on the region](image)

V. TERRORISM IMPACT PREVENTING STRATEGIES

The researchers have also discussed the terrorism impact prevention approaches. Findings on terrorism and tourism reveal diverse strategies. The communication strategy and cultural mega-events provide a way of enhancing a city’s image, developed to maintain leadership, despite the terrorist attacks (Seraphin, 2017). The study also suggested that states should mainly invest in guarding their borders, collecting preventive intelligence and building effective border control, establishing international cooperation, and sharing information about potential foreign terrorists (Seraphin, 2017). The six categories of terrorism prevention practices that emerged for tourism destinations in Turkey are education, cooperation, technical human resources, physical, policing, and prediction (Kılıçlar, 2018). Only very few studies have discussed the impact of preventing strategies on terrorism and gaps in the literature in this area.

A word cloud, a visual representation of words, can reveal the significant keywords used in the reviews. Cloud creators highlight famous words and phrases based on frequency and relevance. The keywords used in the review can be displayed as the following word cloud (Figure 8).

![Figure 8. Word clouds of keywords on terrorism and tourism](image)

VI. CONCLUSION

After processing 37 research papers from the Scopus database on terrorism and tourism from 2010 to 2019, the resultant literature selection was classified into four primary areas; 1) Nature of the relationship between terrorism and tourism, 2) Critical challenges related to terrorism, 3) Regional effects of terrorism on tourism, and 4) Terrorism impact preventing strategies. This review performed the literature classification after analyzing the research work on terrorism and tourism according to the publication year, citation, publishers, source journals, and country of research in descriptive analysis.

This review, like other studies, had several limitations and research gaps. The research was limited to the studies using the keywords of terrorism and tourism in the SCOPUS database, from 2010 to 2019. This study expects future researchers to perform a survey of the positive impact of terrorism and tourism, challenges faced by the tourism industry due to terrorism, and strategies to prevent terrorism. Also, future researchers could emphasize on review articles in other databases to reach a broad spectrum of studies and have a complete portrait of the area.

Most studies have identified a negative relationship between terrorism and tourism. There is still a gap in the literature to discuss terrorism and tourism as all scholars have paid attention to the relationships. Thus, the systematic review recommends future research should focus more on under-discussed regions, challenges of tourism due to terrorism, and strategies to prevent terrorism impacts.

Acknowledgment

This research was supported by the Accelerating Higher Education Expansion and Development (AHEAD) Operation of the Ministry of Higher Education funded by the World Bank.
VII. REFERENCES


42. Yap G., Saha S. (2013). Do political instability, terrorism, and corruption have deterring effects on tourism development even in the presence of UNESCO heritage? A cross-country panel estimates. Tourism Analysis, 18(5), 587-599.